

CONTENTS

Abstract	3
Copyright Statement.....	8
Acknowledgements	9
1. Introduction.....	13
Creative Collaboration in Organizational Teams.....	13
Diversity.....	14
Shared Task Commitment	15
A Supportive and Challenging Environment.....	16
Improving Collaborative Performance	17
Co-location.....	17
Prototyping.....	18
External Representations in Design Interaction	19
Opportunities and Challenges.....	20
Studies of Representation in Design	21
Studies of Technologically Mediated Interaction	21
Emerging Practices: Radical Co-location and Real-time Design.....	22
The Contribution of this Study	24
2. Literature Review	27
Design Activity and Design Interaction.....	27
Design-as-Search.....	28
Design-as-Conversation.....	30
Design as Social Process and Group Activity	34
Communicative Behaviour in Design Groups.....	35
Communication and Coordination Functions of Design Artefacts	38
Relevant Theoretical Perspectives	40
Symbolic Interactionism	41
Situated Action	42
Actor-network Theory.....	44
Activity Theory	46
Distributed Cognition.....	51
Summary of Points from Theoretical Perspectives	54
Theoretically-informed Ethnographic Studies of Engineering Design.....	55
Henderson: Conscriptioin Devices and Meta-indexicality	55
Carlile: Boundary Objects and Knowledge Transformation	57
Bucciarelli: Object Worlds and Collective Story-making	59
Summary of Theoretic Refinements from Ethnographic Accounts	61
Bounding the Concept of Representation	63
Externality.....	63
Sharedness and Persistence.....	65
Co-construction	66
Understanding the Co-construction of Design Representations.....	67
Summary	71
3. Methodology	73
Case Study Methods.....	73
Case Study Designs and Purposes.....	74
Criteria for Case Study Quality	75
Robust Analyses in Case Studies	76

Interaction Analysis	78
Macro vs. Micro Levels of Analysis	79
Segmentation and Units of Analysis	80
Attention to Trouble and Repair	80
Observational Categories and Coding Schemes	81
Design Reasoning: Formal Logic	81
Design Reasoning: Action (or Transaction) Structure	82
Linear Progression vs. Iteration	84
Process vs. Content	85
Shifts in Modality, Medium and Temporal Locus	86
Structural vs. Categorical Coding	89
Summary	90
4. Field Research & Macro Analysis	93
Preparation for Fieldwork	94
Background on JPL Practice	94
Preliminary Site Visit	95
Patterns in the Work: Domains, Chairs and Tools	97
Data Collection Setup and Limitations on Access	99
Field Observation	100
The Design Study	101
The Cryobot Lander	101
The Customers and the Team	102
Key Design Challenges	104
In-Session Observations	105
Outside and Background Interviews	107
Macro Analysis	108
Phase I—Qualitative Analysis and Thematic Content Coding	109
Initial Parsing	111
Phase II—Video Review	111
Triangulation and Selection of Episodes for Microanalysis	113
A More Complex Logic for Topic Shifts	117
Final Selection of Episodes	121
5. Micro Analysis	125
Exploratory Coding	125
Initial Distinctions	126
Collective Design Reasoning	128
Adopting a Network Approach	131
Nodes: Actors and Discourse	132
Arcs: Communicative Acts, Alignment and the Spatial Metaphor	133
Initial Network Coding	135
Essential Determinations Required to Construct a Network from Interaction	136
Reliability of Layout Diagrams	140
Depicting the “Connectedness” of Discourse	143
Iterative Elaboration and Refinement of the Coding Scheme	146
Adjusting Temporal Durations to Favour Design Discourse	147
Depicting Interaction with Shared Representations	148
Final Form of Coding Scheme	149
6. Micro-Analytic Results	153
Overview	153
Animated Networks and Real-Time Interaction	155
Cumulative Networks, Participation and Integration of Representations	163

Conventional Network Metrics	169
Overall Alignment and Total Degree	170
Mutual Engagement and Discourse Betweenness	173
Categorical Composition of Coding	177
7. Macro-Analytic Results.....	199
Threads.....	199
Sensitive Electronics	200
Radiator Configuration	202
Start-up Sequence Timeline.....	204
Data Rate and Telecom Architecture	207
Landing Site Selection	208
Mediated Convergence of the Landing Site Impasse.....	213
8. Synthesis and Interpretation of Findings.....	219
Quality of Design Conversation	219
Quantitative Measures: Overall Alignment and Mutual Engagement	220
Qualitative Judgements: Participation and Integration	222
Composition and Temporal Development of Discourse.....	224
Representational Support.....	226
Roles and Situational Attributes of Representations.....	227
Representational Dynamics in Real-time Design.....	231
9. Reflection and Elaboration.....	237
Methodological Issues and Reflection	237
Study Quality Revisited	238
Issues and Limitations on Analytic Generalization from this Setting	240
Problematic Aspects of Coding and Analysis	244
Elaboration for Further Work.....	246
Refined Questions and Follow-on Hypotheses	246
Extension of the Formalization	247
Theoretical Implications	253
Constellations of Issues and Actors	254
Implications for Extant Theorizing	256
10. Conclusion	259
Objectives and Motivations	259
Contributions of the Study.....	260
Broader Implications.....	262
Team Performance	262
Social Cognition	264
Technologies for Engagement and Co-construction	265
Collective Wisdom.....	268
Representations and the Research Process	269
Glossary	271
References.....	275
Appendices.....	291

FIGURES

Figure 4-1 Panorama of the Team in Action	96
Figure 4-2 CSMAD Room Layout and Camera Placement	99
Figure 4-3 (a) Previous Illustration of Deployed Cryobot (b) Final Design from Cryobot Lander Study.....	102
Figure 4-4 Video Review Setup	112
Figure 4-5 Master Timeline and Post-session Interview Timeline	114
Figure 4-6 Episode Selection based on Positive and Negative Indicators.....	116
Figure 4-7 Elaborated Typology of Transitions and Topic Shifts.....	118
Figure 4-8 Revised Parsing of Sessions based on Conversational Sub-Projects	119
Figure 4-9 Internal Structure of Episodes Selected and Excluded	122
Figure 5-1 QSR NVivo Screen.....	130
Figure 5-2 (a) An Actor connected to Discourse, (b) A Bipartite Actor-Discourse Network	132
Figure 5-3 Basic Arc Strength Scheme for Alignment	134
Figure 5-4 (a) Temporal Aggregation of Arcs in a Slice, (b) A Network Layout.....	137
Figure 5-5 Slice Width/Aggregation Interval (a) Narrow for Real-time and (b) Wide for Cumulative Aggregate Layouts.....	139
Figure 5-6 Cumulative Layouts and Stability Overview	141
Figure 5-7 Symmetrical vs. Asymmetrical Layouts of Fully-Connected Graphs	142
Figure 5-8 Example Semantic Association Arcs.....	145
Figure 5-9 Example Collaborative Product Arcs	145
Figure 5-10 Real-time Network and Video	146
Figure 5-11 Varying Arc Duration in (a) Real-Time and (b) Cumulative Aggregate Layouts	147
Figure 6-1(a-e) Total Degree Graphs and Timelines for Selected Episodes	172
Figure 6-2(a-e) Discourse Betweenness at Check Slices across Selected Episodes	175
Figure 6-3 Coding Overview Diagram: Episode 7.....	179
Figure 6-4 Coding Overview Diagram: Episode 12.....	180
Figure 6-5 Coding Overview Diagrams: Episode 21	181
Figure 6-6 Coding Overview Diagrams: Episode 39	182
Figure 6-7 Coding Overview Diagrams: Episode 54.....	183
Figure 6-8 Cumulative Aggregate Network Diagrams: Episode 7	184
Figure 6-9 Cumulative Aggregate Network Diagrams: Episode 12	185
Figure 6-10 Cumulative Aggregate Network Diagrams: Episode 21	186
Figure 6-11 Cumulative Aggregate Network Diagrams: Episode 39	187
Figure 6-12 Cumulative Aggregate Network Diagrams: Episode 54	188
Figure 6-13 Total Degree & Timeline: Episode 7.....	189
Figure 6-14 Total Degree & Timeline: Episode 12.....	190
Figure 6-15 Total Degree & Timeline: Episode 21.....	191
Figure 6-16 Total Degree & Timeline: Episode 39.....	192
Figure 6-17 Total Degree & Timeline: Episode 54.....	193
Figure 6-18 Discourse Betweenness: Episode 7	194
Figure 6-19 Discourse Betweenness: Episode 12	195
Figure 6-20 Discourse Betweenness: Episode 21	196
Figure 6-21 Discourse Betweenness: Episode 39	197
Figure 6-22 Discourse Betweenness: Episode 54	198
Figure 7-1 E7 Slice 156 (a) Full and (b) Actor-Discourse Networks	201
Figure 7-2 Example Porkchop Plot for 2005.....	210
Figure 7-3 HL's Journal Article Illustrations	211
Figure 7-4 (a) Journal Article Illustration (b) Landing Site from Previous Report	212
Figure 7-5 Mars Orbiter Camera (a) Composite Image of North Polar Region; (b) High- Resolution Image of Final Landing Site	213

Figure 7-6 ZD's Objectified-motive and Proximal Concerns	215
Figure 7-7 HL's Objectified-motive and Proximal Concerns	215
Figure 7-8 Mediated Convergence of ZD and HL on a Northern Polar Landing Site.....	217
Figure 8-1 Spiral Depiction of Representational Stabilization.....	226
Figure 8-2 Framework for Representational Support	230
Figure 8-3 Acceleration and Compression in Real-time Design.....	233
Figure 8-4 Representational Generativity vs. Stabilization	234
Figure 10-1 Still Images from the Film "Minority Report"	266
Figure 10-2 Will Alsop's Large Paintings.....	267

TABLES

Table 4-1 Project Stakeholders and Design Team Members, Chairs and Experience.....	103
Table 4-2 Design Issue Threads	110
Table 4-3 Indicators for Criterion Variable Triangulation	113
Table 4-4 Scheme for Diagramming Topic Shifts based on Conversational Sub-Projects	118
Table 4-5 Summary of Selected Episodes (Thread, Attributes and Content).....	123
Table 5-1 Macro-level Content Coding and Examples.....	126
Table 5-2 Participants' Overall Contribution Rates to Mission Design Discussion.....	130
Table 5-3 Categories and Symbols for Node Types	133
Table 5-4 Application of the Spatial Metaphor to Elements of Design Reasoning	134
Table 5-5 Example Sequence of Design Discourse Acts and Corresponding Network Diagrams	135
Table 5-6 Classes of Arcs: Types of Nodes Connected vs. Relative Duration	149
Table 5-7 Final Act Coding Scheme	151
Table 6-1 Characteristics of Selected Episodes.....	154
Table 6-2 Categories of Results and Presentation Formats	155
Table 6-3 Animated Network Diagram: Collaboration over Shared Representations #1 ..	157
Table 6-4 Animated Network Diagram: Collaboration over Shared Representations #2 ..	158
Table 6-5 Animated Network Diagram: Collaboration over Shared Representations #3 ..	159
Table 6-6 Animated Network Diagram: Confusion and Repair over a Design Detail	160
Table 6-7 Animated Network Diagram: Agreement on a Trade Between Two Approaches	161
Table 6-8 Animated Network Diagram: Convergence on a Design Direction.....	162
Table 6-9 Summary of Selected Movie/Image Sequences	163
Table 6-10 Full Episode Cumulative Aggregate Diagrams.....	165
Table 8-1 Factors of Quality of Design Conversation	225
Table 8-2 Roles of Shared Representations in Design Interaction.....	228
Table 8-3 Situational Attributes, Associated Roles and Actor-Network Manifestations ...	229

COPYRIGHT STATEMENT

This text represents the submission for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the Royal College of Art. This copy has been supplied for the purpose of research for private study, on the understanding that it is copyright material, and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.